

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
for the
District of Maryland

| | | |
|-------------------------|---|------------------------------------|
| Alfred Chestnut, et al. |) | |
| <i>Plaintiff</i> |) | |
| v. |) | Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-02342-LKG |
| Donald Kincaid, et al |) | |
| <i>Defendant</i> |) | |

**SUBPOENA TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS, INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS
OR TO PERMIT INSPECTION OF PREMISES IN A CIVIL ACTION**

To: The New Yorker, Conde Nast Entertainment LLC c/o Registered Agent Sabin, Bermant & Gould LLP
ATTN: Managing Partner One World Trade Center, 44th Floor, New York, NY 10007

(Name of person to whom this subpoena is directed)

Production: YOU ARE COMMANDED to produce at the time, date, and place set forth below the following documents, electronically stored information, or objects, and to permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the material: PLEASE SEE ATTACHED RIDER

| | |
|--|--------------------------------------|
| Place: Nathan & Kamionski, LLP 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402 Baltimore, MD 21201 | Date and Time: 11/24/2021 9:00 am |
|--|--------------------------------------|

Inspection of Premises: YOU ARE COMMANDED to permit entry onto the designated premises, land, or other property possessed or controlled by you at the time, date, and location set forth below, so that the requesting party may inspect, measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample the property or any designated object or operation on it.

| | |
|--------|----------------|
| Place: | Date and Time: |
|--------|----------------|

The following provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 45 are attached – Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; Rule 45(d), relating to your protection as a person subject to a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to respond to this subpoena and the potential consequences of not doing so.

Date: 11/03/2021

CLERK OF COURT

OR

/s/Mayer Engelsberg

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Attorney's signature

The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number of the attorney representing (*name of party*) _____
Individual Defendants _____, who issues or requests this subpoena, are:

Mayer Engelsberg, 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402, Baltimore, MD 21201 mengelsberg@nklawllp.com (410) 885-4349

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

If this subpoena commands the production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things or the inspection of premises before trial, a notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MARYLAND

ALFRED CHESTNUT,)
ANDREW STEWART, JR,)
and RANSOM WATKINS,)
)
Plaintiffs,)
)
v.) 1:20-cv-02342-LKG
)
DONALD KINCAID, et. al.,)
)
Defendants.)

SUBPOENA RIDER

Please provide any and all audio or video recordings of statements provided or interviews conducted with anyone in connection with the article, "When a Witness Recants," published in the New Yorker, (October 25, 2021), including but not limited to audio or video recordings of:

- Ronald Bishop
- Lauren Lipscomb
- Brian Ellis
- Ransom Watkins
- Alfred Chestnut
- Andrew Stewart

** Please provide production by U.S. Mail to Nathan & Kamionski LLP, 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402, Baltimore, MD, 21201 or by email to Jill Byczek at jbyczek@nklawllp.com.

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-02342-LKG

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)*

I received this subpoena for (name of individual and title, if any) _____

on (date) _____ .

 I served the subpoena by delivering a copy to the named person as follows: _____

on (date) _____ ; or _____

 I returned the subpoena unexecuted because: _____

Unless the subpoena was issued on behalf of the United States, or one of its officers or agents, I have also tendered to the witness the fees for one day's attendance, and the mileage allowed by law, in the amount of

\$ _____ .

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 _____ .

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: 11/17/21

Server's signature

Jill Byczek, Paralegal

Printed name and title

Nathan& Kamionski LLP
575 S. Charles St., Suite 402
Baltimore, MD 21201

Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

| | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|---|---|
| SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION | | COMPLETE THIS SECTION ON DELIVERY | | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complete items 1, 2, and 3. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. | | <p>A. Signature <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agent <input type="checkbox"/> Addressee</p> <p>B. Received by (Printed Name) _____ C. Date of Delivery _____</p> <p>D. Is delivery address different from item 1? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes If YES, enter delivery address below: <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>E. Service Type</p> <table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;"> <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature Restricted Delivery <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail® <input type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Mail <input type="checkbox"/> Mail Restricted Delivery <small>(over \$500)</small> </td> <td style="width: 50%;"> <input type="checkbox"/> Priority Mail Express® <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail™ <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation™ <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation Restricted Delivery </td> </tr> </table> | | <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature Restricted Delivery <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail® <input type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Mail <input type="checkbox"/> Mail Restricted Delivery <small>(over \$500)</small> | <input type="checkbox"/> Priority Mail Express® <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail™ <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation™ <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation Restricted Delivery |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature Restricted Delivery <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail® <input type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Mail <input type="checkbox"/> Mail Restricted Delivery <small>(over \$500)</small> | <input type="checkbox"/> Priority Mail Express® <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail™ <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation™ <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation Restricted Delivery | | | | |
| 1. Article Addressed to: The New Yorker, Conde Nast Entertainment LLC c/o RA Sabin, Berman & Gould LLP Attn: Managing Partner One World Trade Center, 44 th Floor New York, NY 10007 | | | | | |
|  9590 9402 6524 0346 0849 67 | | | | | |
| 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) 7021 1970 0001 1482 0432 | | | | | |

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 (c), (d), (e), and (g) (Effective 12/1/13)

(c) Place of Compliance.

(1) For a Trial, Hearing, or Deposition. A subpoena may command a person to attend a trial, hearing, or deposition only as follows:

(A) within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; or

(B) within the state where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person, if the person

(i) is a party or a party's officer; or

(ii) is commanded to attend a trial and would not incur substantial expense.

(2) For Other Discovery. A subpoena may command:

(A) production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things at a place within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; and

(B) inspection of premises at the premises to be inspected.

(d) Protecting a Person Subject to a Subpoena; Enforcement.

(1) Avoiding Undue Burden or Expense; Sanctions. A party or attorney responsible for issuing and serving a subpoena must take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena. The court for the district where compliance is required must enforce this duty and impose an appropriate sanction—which may include lost earnings and reasonable attorney's fees—on a party or attorney who fails to comply.

(2) Command to Produce Materials or Permit Inspection.

(A) Appearance Not Required. A person commanded to produce documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, or to permit the inspection of premises, need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless also commanded to appear for a deposition, hearing, or trial.

(B) Objections. A person commanded to produce documents or tangible things or to permit inspection may serve on the party or attorney designated in the subpoena a written objection to inspecting, copying, testing, or sampling any or all of the materials or to inspecting the premises—or to producing electronically stored information in the form or forms requested. The objection must be served before the earlier of the time specified for compliance or 14 days after the subpoena is served. If an objection is made, the following rules apply:

(i) At any time, on notice to the commanded person, the serving party may move the court for the district where compliance is required for an order compelling production or inspection.

(ii) These acts may be required only as directed in the order, and the order must protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from significant expense resulting from compliance.

(3) Quashing or Modifying a Subpoena.

(A) When Required. On timely motion, the court for the district where compliance is required must quash or modify a subpoena that:

(i) fails to allow a reasonable time to comply;

(ii) requires a person to comply beyond the geographical limits specified in Rule 45(c);

(iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter, if no exception or waiver applies; or

(iv) subjects a person to undue burden.

(B) When Permitted. To protect a person subject to or affected by a subpoena, the court for the district where compliance is required may, on motion, quash or modify the subpoena if it requires:

(i) disclosing a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information; or

(ii) disclosing an unretained expert's opinion or information that does not describe specific occurrences in dispute and results from the expert's study that was not requested by a party.

(C) Specifying Conditions as an Alternative. In the circumstances described in Rule 45(d)(3)(B), the court may, instead of quashing or modifying a subpoena, order appearance or production under specified conditions if the serving party:

(i) shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship; and

(ii) ensures that the subpoenaed person will be reasonably compensated.

(e) Duties in Responding to a Subpoena.

(1) Producing Documents or Electronically Stored Information. These procedures apply to producing documents or electronically stored information:

(A) Documents. A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents must produce them as they are kept in the ordinary course of business or must organize and label them to correspond to the categories in the demand.

(B) Form for Producing Electronically Stored Information Not Specified. If a subpoena does not specify a form for producing electronically stored information, the person responding must produce it in a form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a reasonably usable form or forms.

(C) Electronically Stored Information Produced in Only One Form. The person responding need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.

(D) Inaccessible Electronically Stored Information. The person responding need not provide discovery of electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective order, the person responding must show that the information is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the court may nonetheless order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, considering the limitations of Rule 26(b)(2)(C). The court may specify conditions for the discovery.

(2) Claiming Privilege or Protection.

(A) Information Withheld. A person withholding subpoenaed information under a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial-preparation material must:

(i) expressly make the claim; and

(ii) describe the nature of the withheld documents, communications, or tangible things in a manner that, without revealing information itself privileged or protected, will enable the parties to assess the claim.

(B) Information Produced. If information produced in response to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation material, the person making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a party must promptly return, sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has; must not use or disclose the information until the claim is resolved; must take reasonable steps to retrieve the information if the party disclosed it before being notified; and may promptly present the information under seal to the court for the district where compliance is required for a determination of the claim. The person who produced the information must preserve the information until the claim is resolved.

(g) Contempt.

The court for the district where compliance is required—and also, after a motion is transferred, the issuing court—may hold in contempt a person who, having been served, fails without adequate excuse to obey the subpoena or an order related to it.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
for the
District of Maryland

Alfred Chestnut, et al. _____)
Plaintiff _____)
v. _____) Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-02342-LKG
Donald Kincaid, et al _____)
Defendant _____)

**SUBPOENA TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS, INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS
OR TO PERMIT INSPECTION OF PREMISES IN A CIVIL ACTION**

To: The New Yorker, Advance Magazine Publishers Inc. c/o Registered Agent C/O Corporation Service Company
80 State Street, Albany, NY 12207-2543

(Name of person to whom this subpoena is directed)

Production: YOU ARE COMMANDED to produce at the time, date, and place set forth below the following documents, electronically stored information, or objects, and to permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the material: PLEASE SEE ATTACHED RIDER

| | |
|--|--------------------------------------|
| Place: Nathan & Kamionski, LLP 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402 Baltimore, MD 21201 | Date and Time: 11/24/2021 9:00 am |
|--|--------------------------------------|

Inspection of Premises: YOU ARE COMMANDED to permit entry onto the designated premises, land, or other property possessed or controlled by you at the time, date, and location set forth below, so that the requesting party may inspect, measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample the property or any designated object or operation on it.

| | |
|--------|----------------|
| Place: | Date and Time: |
|--------|----------------|

The following provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 45 are attached – Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; Rule 45(d), relating to your protection as a person subject to a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to respond to this subpoena and the potential consequences of not doing so.

Date: 11/03/2021

CLERK OF COURT

OR

/s/Mayer Engelsberg

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Attorney's signature

The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number of the attorney representing (*name of party*) _____
Individual Defendants _____, who issues or requests this subpoena, are:

Mayer Engelsberg, 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402, Baltimore, MD 21201 mengelsberg@nklawllp.com (410) 885-4349

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

If this subpoena commands the production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things or the inspection of premises before trial, a notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MARYLAND

ALFRED CHESTNUT,)
ANDREW STEWART, JR,)
and RANSOM WATKINS,)
)
Plaintiffs,)
)
v.) 1:20-cv-02342-LKG
)
DONALD KINCAID, et. al.,)
)
Defendants.)

SUBPOENA RIDER

Please provide any and all audio or video recordings of statements provided or interviews conducted with anyone in connection with the article, "When a Witness Recants," published in the New Yorker, (October 25, 2021), including but not limited to audio or video recordings of:

- Ronald Bishop
- Lauren Lipscomb
- Brian Ellis
- Ransom Watkins
- Alfred Chestnut
- Andrew Stewart

** Please provide production by U.S. Mail to Nathan & Kamionski LLP, 575 S. Charles St., Suite 402, Baltimore, MD, 21201 or by email to Jill Byczek at jbyczek@nklawllp.com.

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-02342-LKG

PROOF OF SERVICE*(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)*I received this subpoena for (*name of individual and title, if any*) _____on (*date*) _____ . I served the subpoena by delivering a copy to the named person as follows:_____
on (*date*) _____ ; or I returned the subpoena unexecuted because: _____

Unless the subpoena was issued on behalf of the United States, or one of its officers or agents, I have also tendered to the witness the fees for one day's attendance, and the mileage allowed by law, in the amount of

\$ _____ .

My fees are \$ _____ for travel and \$ _____ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 _____ .

I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.

Date: 11/30/21

Server's signature

Jill Byczek, Paralegal

Printed name and title

Nathan & Kamionski LLP
575 S. Charles St., Suite 402
Baltimore, MD 21201_____
Server's address

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

| | |
|---|--|
| SENDER: COMPLETE THIS SECTION | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Complete items 1, 2, and 3. <input type="checkbox"/> Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you. <input type="checkbox"/> Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits. | |
| 1. Article Addressed: The New Yorker, Advance Magazine Publishers Inc. c/o RA Registered Agent C/O Corporation Service Company 80 State St. Albany, NY 12207 | |
| 2. Article Number (Transfer from service label) 7021 1970 0001 1482 0447 | |
| 3. Service Type <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature <input type="checkbox"/> Priority Mail Express® <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail™ <input type="checkbox"/> Adult Signature Mail <input type="checkbox"/> Registered Mail Restricted <input type="checkbox"/> Certified Mail Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation <input type="checkbox"/> Collect on Delivery Restricted Delivery <input type="checkbox"/> Signature Confirmation <input type="checkbox"/> Insured Mail <input type="checkbox"/> Restricted Delivery | |
|  9590 9402 6524 0346 0849 50 | |
| PS Form 3811, July 2020 PSN 7330-02-000-9053 Domestic Return Receipt | |

Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 (c), (d), (e), and (g) (Effective 12/1/13)

(c) Place of Compliance.

(1) For a Trial, Hearing, or Deposition. A subpoena may command a person to attend a trial, hearing, or deposition only as follows:

(A) within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; or

(B) within the state where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person, if the person

(i) is a party or a party's officer; or

(ii) is commanded to attend a trial and would not incur substantial expense.

(2) For Other Discovery. A subpoena may command:

(A) production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things at a place within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; and

(B) inspection of premises at the premises to be inspected.

(d) Protecting a Person Subject to a Subpoena; Enforcement.

(1) Avoiding Undue Burden or Expense; Sanctions. A party or attorney responsible for issuing and serving a subpoena must take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena. The court for the district where compliance is required must enforce this duty and impose an appropriate sanction—which may include lost earnings and reasonable attorney's fees—on a party or attorney who fails to comply.

(2) Command to Produce Materials or Permit Inspection.

(A) Appearance Not Required. A person commanded to produce documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, or to permit the inspection of premises, need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless also commanded to appear for a deposition, hearing, or trial.

(B) Objections. A person commanded to produce documents or tangible things or to permit inspection may serve on the party or attorney designated in the subpoena a written objection to inspecting, copying, testing, or sampling any or all of the materials or to inspecting the premises—or to producing electronically stored information in the form or forms requested. The objection must be served before the earlier of the time specified for compliance or 14 days after the subpoena is served. If an objection is made, the following rules apply:

(i) At any time, on notice to the commanded person, the serving party may move the court for the district where compliance is required for an order compelling production or inspection.

(ii) These acts may be required only as directed in the order, and the order must protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from significant expense resulting from compliance.

(3) Quashing or Modifying a Subpoena.

(A) When Required. On timely motion, the court for the district where compliance is required must quash or modify a subpoena that:

(i) fails to allow a reasonable time to comply;

(ii) requires a person to comply beyond the geographical limits specified in Rule 45(c);

(iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter, if no exception or waiver applies; or

(iv) subjects a person to undue burden.

(B) When Permitted. To protect a person subject to or affected by a subpoena, the court for the district where compliance is required may, on motion, quash or modify the subpoena if it requires:

(i) disclosing a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information; or

(ii) disclosing an unretained expert's opinion or information that does not describe specific occurrences in dispute and results from the expert's study that was not requested by a party.

(C) Specifying Conditions as an Alternative. In the circumstances described in Rule 45(d)(3)(B), the court may, instead of quashing or modifying a subpoena, order appearance or production under specified conditions if the serving party:

(i) shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship; and

(ii) ensures that the subpoenaed person will be reasonably compensated.

(e) Duties in Responding to a Subpoena.

(1) Producing Documents or Electronically Stored Information. These procedures apply to producing documents or electronically stored information:

(A) Documents. A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents must produce them as they are kept in the ordinary course of business or must organize and label them to correspond to the categories in the demand.

(B) Form for Producing Electronically Stored Information Not Specified. If a subpoena does not specify a form for producing electronically stored information, the person responding must produce it in a form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a reasonably usable form or forms.

(C) Electronically Stored Information Produced in Only One Form. The person responding need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.

(D) Inaccessible Electronically Stored Information. The person responding need not provide discovery of electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective order, the person responding must show that the information is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the court may nonetheless order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, considering the limitations of Rule 26(b)(2)(C). The court may specify conditions for the discovery.

(2) Claiming Privilege or Protection.

(A) Information Withheld. A person withholding subpoenaed information under a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial-preparation material must:

(i) expressly make the claim; and

(ii) describe the nature of the withheld documents, communications, or tangible things in a manner that, without revealing information itself privileged or protected, will enable the parties to assess the claim.

(B) Information Produced. If information produced in response to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation material, the person making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a party must promptly return, sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has; must not use or disclose the information until the claim is resolved; must take reasonable steps to retrieve the information if the party disclosed it before being notified; and may promptly present the information under seal to the court for the district where compliance is required for a determination of the claim. The person who produced the information must preserve the information until the claim is resolved.

(g) Contempt.

The court for the district where compliance is required—and also, after a motion is transferred, the issuing court—may hold in contempt a person who, having been served, fails without adequate excuse to obey the subpoena or an order related to it.